

CITY OF MUSKEGON
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES

March 1, 2016

Chairperson J. Hilt called the meeting to order at 4:03 p.m. and roll was taken.

MEMBERS PRESENT: J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, D. Warren

MEMBERS ABSENT: S. Kroes, K. Panozzo

STAFF PRESENT: M. Franzak, D. Renkenberger

OTHERS PRESENT: K. George, Community EnCompass, 1105 Terrace St.; W. Barnhart, MSI Construction, 4420 W Bard Rd, Whitehall; M. Rundquist, Muskegon Eagles, 621 W Western Ave.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion to approve the regular meeting minutes of February 2, 2016 was made by J. Hilt, supported by S. Radtke and unanimously approved.

A. Riegler arrived at 4:05 p.m.

NEW BUSINESS

Case 2016-03 – 38 Diana Avenue. Applicant: Bethany Housing Ministries. District: McLaughlin. Current Function: Residential. The applicant had originally sought approval to cover the wood siding on the lower portion of the house with vinyl siding and to wrap the soffit and fascia with aluminum. The upper portion of the house has vinyl shake siding, which was done under a previous owner. The request was later revised to retain the current wood soffit and fascia. They are also requesting to add a privacy fence in the back yard.

J. Hilt stated that she had gone by the house and looked at the wood siding, which appeared to be in good condition. She stated that if that was the case, paint was the preferred choice over vinyl. K. George stated that the upper portion of the house was already sided with vinyl shakes, and the windows were vinyl replacement as well. This house had been extensively rehabbed 6 or 7 years ago, and the exterior was repainted again last summer. However, the paint was still peeling and they were unsure what was causing it. K. George didn't think that vinyl siding would alter the look of the home, and it would be easier to maintain for the long-term, especially for a lower-income homeowner. She also indicated that they had reconsidered wrapping the soffit and fascia, and had decided to retain those wood features, as well as the wood frieze board and the wood trim around the windows. S. Radtke stated that, although he would normally be opposed to vinyl siding, in this case he would consider it since the top portion of the house already had vinyl. He asked if they were going to just cover the wood siding with the vinyl, or remove the wood. K. George stated that they would retain the wood siding and just cover it with the vinyl.

A motion that the HDC approve the request to cover the wood siding with vinyl, as long as 1) the profile matches within 1 inch, 2) the wooden window frames, trim, and frieze boards are retained, 3) the soffit and fascia remain wood, 4) all zoning requirements are met, and 5) any necessary permits are obtained, was made by A. Riegler, supported by D. Warren and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

The request to install the fence was voted on separately. K. George provided pictures of both vinyl and cedar fencing, and stated that they were willing to use either one, depending on the HDC's preference. J. Hilt asked if just the back yard would be fenced. K. George stated that was correct; the back yard abutted a church parking lot and they wished to provide some privacy in the yard. J. Hilt asked if the fence would be 6 feet tall. K. George stated that was correct. D. Warren asked what the policy was regarding vinyl fencing. S. Radtke stated that it was not generally allowed, but there had been exceptions made in the past. Board members concurred that the cedar fencing would be preferable.

A motion to allow the 6-foot cedar fencing as proposed, with the condition that the necessary permit is obtained, was made by S. Radtke, supported by L. Wood and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

OLD BUSINESS

Case 2016-02 – 621 W. Western Avenue. Applicant: Muskegon Eagles. District: Clay-Western. Current Function: Recreational. This case was tabled from the February meeting. W. Barnhart provide a shop drawing of the revised doorway to be installed. The opening and window configuration matched the existing doorway and windows. He stated that they would replace the steel jamb with aluminum. A. Riegler asked if the transom matched. W. Barnhart stated that it did. The frame would be a dark bronze aluminum, and he asked if they could use low-E glass. M. Franzak stated that was allowed, as long as the glass was clear.

A motion to approve the revised entryway door design as proposed was made by S. Radtke, supported by A. Riegler and unanimously approved, with J. Hilt, L. Wood, A. Riegler, S. Radtke, and D. Warren voting aye.

M. Rundquist of the Muskegon Eagles inquired about replacing their current sign. It was neon at one time but they were unable to maintain it, so it was covered with a skin. However, it was starting to rot and needed to be replaced. They also wanted to attach a 2-faced LED lighted sign underneath the current sign, to advertise club events. M. Rundquist described the proposed signs. M. Franzak stated that it would be allowed by the sign ordinance, but he needed to fill out another HDC application and provide drawings for the board's review and approval.

OTHER BUSINESS

M. Franzak introduced new board member, City Commissioner Debra Warren.

Staff and board members discussed the former A- and AA-designated historic districts. M. Franzak stated that the standards would need to be updated to reflect only one type of historic district, per state mandate.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:55 p.m.